

Message

---

**From:** Barnicoat, Dana [Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov]  
**Sent:** 11/26/2019 9:03:04 PM  
**To:** Partridge, Charles [Partridge.Charles@epa.gov]  
**Subject:** FW: Manganese, Zinc and Copper and their impact on Human Health in Butte. New Information Reported in today's Montana Standard

---

**From:** Mylott, Richard <Mylott.Richard@epa.gov>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, November 26, 2019 1:58 PM  
**To:** Barnicoat, Dana <Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Mutter, Andrew <mutter.andrew@epa.gov>; Wardell, Christopher <Wardell.Christopher@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Manganese, Zinc and Copper and their impact on Human Health in Butte. New Information Reported in today's Montana Standard

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Have a happy and safe Thanksgiving!

Rich

---

**From:** Barnicoat, Dana <Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, November 26, 2019 1:33 PM  
**To:** Mylott, Richard <Mylott.Richard@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Mutter, Andrew <mutter.andrew@epa.gov>; Wardell, Christopher <Wardell.Christopher@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** FW: Manganese, Zinc and Copper and their impact on Human Health in Butte. New Information Reported in today's Montana Standard

Rich,

Below is a recommendation for a response from team Montana. Please let me know if this will work.

Suggestion: From Dana & Team Montana

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Sincerely,

Dana

---

**From:** Greene, Nikia <[Greene.Nikia@epa.gov](mailto:Greene.Nikia@epa.gov)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, November 26, 2019 12:54 PM  
**To:** Elsen, Henry <[Elsen.Henry@epa.gov](mailto:Elsen.Henry@epa.gov)>; Barnicoat, Dana <[Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov](mailto:Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Vranka, Joe <[vranka.joe@epa.gov](mailto:vranka.joe@epa.gov)>; Partridge, Charles <[Partridge.Charles@epa.gov](mailto:Partridge.Charles@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Manganese, Zinc and Copper and their impact on Human Health in Butte. New Information Reported in today's Montana Standard

See below changes for consideration.

Nikia Greene  
Remedial Project Manager  
U.S. EPA, Region 8  
(406)-457-5019  
[green.nikia@epa.gov](mailto:green.nikia@epa.gov)

---

**From:** Elsen, Henry <[Elsen.Henry@epa.gov](mailto:Elsen.Henry@epa.gov)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, November 26, 2019 12:32 PM  
**To:** Barnicoat, Dana <[Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov](mailto:Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov)>; Greene, Nikia <[Greene.Nikia@epa.gov](mailto:Greene.Nikia@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Vranka, Joe <[vranka.joe@epa.gov](mailto:vranka.joe@epa.gov)>; Partridge, Charles <[Partridge.Charles@epa.gov](mailto:Partridge.Charles@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Manganese, Zinc and Copper and their impact on Human Health in Butte. New Information Reported in today's Montana Standard

See my suggested edits to the statement below.

Henry Elsen  
Senior Assistant Regional Counsel  
CERCLA Enforcement Section  
Office of Regional Counsel  
U.S. EPA Region 8 Montana Office  
Federal Building, Suite 3200  
10 West 15<sup>th</sup> Street  
Helena, Montana 59626  
406 457-5030

---

**From:** Barnicoat, Dana <[Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov](mailto:Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, November 26, 2019 12:25 PM  
**To:** Greene, Nikia <[Greene.Nikia@epa.gov](mailto:Greene.Nikia@epa.gov)>; Elsen, Henry <[Elsen.Henry@epa.gov](mailto:Elsen.Henry@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Vranka, Joe <[vranka.joe@epa.gov](mailto:vranka.joe@epa.gov)>; Partridge, Charles <[Partridge.Charles@epa.gov](mailto:Partridge.Charles@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Manganese, Zinc and Copper and their impact on Human Health in Butte. New Information Reported in today's Montana Standard

All,

After talking with Nikia, the responses in the attached document are probably more for the Superfund Health Advisory Working Group to determine. However, we still need one general statement for Rich. Suggestions and comments are welcome. See below.

**From:** Mylott, Richard <[Mylott.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Mylott.Richard@epa.gov)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, November 26, 2019 9:58 AM  
**To:** Mutter, Andrew <[mutter.andrew@epa.gov](mailto:mutter.andrew@epa.gov)>; Barnicoat, Dana <[Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov](mailto:Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Wardell, Christopher <[Wardell.Christopher@epa.gov](mailto:Wardell.Christopher@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Manganese, Zinc and Copper and their impact on Human Health in Butte. New Information Reported in today's Montana Standard

Thx all.

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

possible...

Rich

Suggestion: From Dana

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Sincerely,

Dana

---

**From:** Greene, Nikia <[Greene.Nikia@epa.gov](mailto:Greene.Nikia@epa.gov)>

**Sent:** Tuesday, November 26, 2019 11:43 AM

**To:** Elsen, Henry <[Elsen.Henry@epa.gov](mailto:Elsen.Henry@epa.gov)>; Barnicoat, Dana <[Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov](mailto:Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Vranka, Joe <[vranka.joe@epa.gov](mailto:vranka.joe@epa.gov)>; Partridge, Charles <[Partridge.Charles@epa.gov](mailto:Partridge.Charles@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Manganese, Zinc and Copper and their impact on Human Health in Butte. New Information Reported in today's Montana Standard

Confidential  
Do Not Release

All,

Attached is some redline from me on Henry's version. I strongly recommend that Charlie looks at these draft responses. I also recommend that the Superfund Health Study Working Group looks at the responses. We use them in every response. Note: both John Ray and Katie Hailer are on the working group.

Thanks,

Nikia Greene

Remedial Project Manager  
U.S. EPA, Region 8  
(406)-457-5019  
[greene.nikia@epa.gov](mailto:greene.nikia@epa.gov)

---

**From:** Elsen, Henry <[Elsen.Henry@epa.gov](mailto:Elsen.Henry@epa.gov)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, November 26, 2019 11:06 AM  
**To:** Barnicoat, Dana <[Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov](mailto:Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov)>; Greene, Nikia <[Greene.Nikia@epa.gov](mailto:Greene.Nikia@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Vranka, Joe <[vranka.joe@epa.gov](mailto:vranka.joe@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Manganese, Zinc and Copper and their impact on Human Health in Butte. New Information Reported in today's Montana Standard

Confidential  
Do Not Release

Dana – see my suggested edits to both your press statement and your response to Dr. Ray in the attached document. Nikia needs to weigh in on this, if he is available today, as he knows the current status of the health studies and I don't.

Henry Elsen  
Senior Assistant Regional Counsel  
CERCLA Enforcement Section  
Office of Regional Counsel  
U.S. EPA Region 8 Montana Office  
Federal Building, Suite 3200  
10 West 15<sup>th</sup> Street  
Helena, Montana 59626  
406 457-5030

---

**From:** Barnicoat, Dana <[Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov](mailto:Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, November 26, 2019 10:45 AM  
**To:** Greene, Nikia <[Greene.Nikia@epa.gov](mailto:Greene.Nikia@epa.gov)>; Elsen, Henry <[Elsen.Henry@epa.gov](mailto:Elsen.Henry@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Vranka, Joe <[vranka.joe@epa.gov](mailto:vranka.joe@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** FW: Manganese, Zinc and Copper and their impact on Human Health in Butte. New Information Reported in today's Montana Standard

All,

I have drafted up a response to Dr. Ray's email. It is only a draft and I tried to answer his questions the best I could. I know you are all subject matter experts and may be able to clarify or add things I missed.

Please track changes and send back to me as soon as possible. Please read the email below from Richard.

A general statement might look like this possibly?

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Sincerely,

Dana

---

**From:** Mylott, Richard <[Mylott.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Mylott.Richard@epa.gov)>

**Sent:** Tuesday, November 26, 2019 10:16 AM

**To:** Barnicoat, Dana <[Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov](mailto:Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Manganese, Zinc and Copper and their impact on Human Health in Butte. New Information Reported in today's Montana Standard

Ok, thanks. Do we have any current Qs or requests for comment from the Standard?

---

**From:** Barnicoat, Dana <[Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov](mailto:Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov)>

**Sent:** Tuesday, November 26, 2019 10:00 AM

**To:** Mylott, Richard <[Mylott.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Mylott.Richard@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Manganese, Zinc and Copper and their impact on Human Health in Butte. New Information Reported in today's Montana Standard

Rich,

I am working on them right now. I'll get a draft over to you as soon as possible.

Sincerely,

Dana

---

**From:** Mylott, Richard <[Mylott.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Mylott.Richard@epa.gov)>

**Sent:** Tuesday, November 26, 2019 9:58 AM

**To:** Mutter, Andrew <[mutter.andrew@epa.gov](mailto:mutter.andrew@epa.gov)>; Barnicoat, Dana <[Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov](mailto:Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Wardell, Christopher <[Wardell.Christopher@epa.gov](mailto:Wardell.Christopher@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Manganese, Zinc and Copper and their impact on Human Health in Butte. New Information Reported in today's Montana Standard

Thx all.

Dana—can you draft a short statement on this for use if we get calls thru the remainder of the week? Barring any specific insights from Charlie or Joe, we probably want to find a simple way to say we will be evaluating the information and how it may inform EPA and our shared efforts with state and local partners.

We also may get the Q from the standard re: if and how this information (or any new found health data and information going forward) are accommodated through current programs or planned measures associated with the pending CD agreement. Tall order, and probably won't be able to go there, but may want to anticipate that in the statement if possible...

Rich

---

**From:** Mutter, Andrew <[mutter.andrew@epa.gov](mailto:mutter.andrew@epa.gov)>

**Sent:** Tuesday, November 26, 2019 8:53 AM

**To:** Barnicoat, Dana <[Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov](mailto:Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov)>; Mylott, Richard <[Mylott.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Mylott.Richard@epa.gov)>

Cc: Wardell, Christopher <Wardell.Christopher@epa.gov>

Subject: FW: Manganese, Zinc and Copper and their impact on Human Health in Butte. New Information Reported in today's Montana Standard

Thx Dana. Adding Rich to the email string incase we need to work a response.

Best regards,

Andrew

**Andrew Mutter**

Director, Public Affairs  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 8 (Denver, CO)

Office: 303.312.6448

Cell: 720.520.3047

Twitter: @EPARegion8

Facebook: U.S. EPA Region 8

Webpage: EPA Region 8 (Mountains and Plains)

---

From: Barnicoat, Dana <Barnicoat.Dana@epa.gov>

Sent: Tuesday, November 26, 2019 8:37 AM

To: Vranka, Joe <vranka.joe@epa.gov>; Greene, Nikia <Greene.Nikia@epa.gov>; Coleman, Charles <Coleman.Charles@epa.gov>

Cc: Wardell, Christopher <Wardell.Christopher@epa.gov>; Mutter, Andrew <mutter.andrew@epa.gov>

Subject: FW: Manganese, Zinc and Copper and their impact on Human Health in Butte. New Information Reported in today's Montana Standard

Below is the link to the article Dr. Ray is referring to.

[https://mtstandard.com/news/local/health-study-shows-startling-levels-of-metals-in-butte-babies/article\\_d7c10bb3-68b6-588f-9028-a828ab17d034.html](https://mtstandard.com/news/local/health-study-shows-startling-levels-of-metals-in-butte-babies/article_d7c10bb3-68b6-588f-9028-a828ab17d034.html)

Sincerely,

Dana

---

From: John Ray **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**

Sent: Tuesday, November 26, 2019 5:54 AM

**Ex. 6 PP Public Involvement Advisory Group**

**Subject:** Manganese, Zinc and Copper and their impact on Human Health in Butte. New Information Reported in today's Montana Standard

While I realize that the Hailer and McDermott study on zinc, manganese and copper that was reported in today's Montana Standard is very, very, very preliminary, it was shocking to me and should be shocking to all who are interested in Butte's public health to read about the levels of copper, manganese and zinc in infants. While this is a very preliminary pre-study, it does raise concerns.

Interest in these three toxics has been pretty much confined, at best, to the effect on aquatic life, not humans. Arsenic, lead and mercury have driven the human health aspect of the cleanup. Zinc, manganese and copper have flown pretty much under the health radar when it comes to Superfund in Butte.

To point, the following questions are pertinent:

1. How can the current cleanup plans be amended to include **consideration** of these three toxics? Do they need to be amended? The consent decree is nearing completion. While we don't know where these individuals reported in the study lived, they may well have lived in the BPSOU operable unit. If so, these toxics should be considered. Also, if some lived in "The Flat," the Westside Soils RI/FS process which is occurring at present should investigate copper, zinc and manganese in the Flat. Failure to do the above would be a serious lapse in protecting public health.
2. How can active mining be considered in the equation? It is difficult if not impossible to distinguish the results of active mining versus historic mining. But that doesn't lessen the obligation to protect public health. There perhaps needs to be greater attention paid to the environmental effects of active mining, which is largely in the purview of MDEQ. MDEQ has not distinguished itself in this regard. Nevertheless, given the potential effect on the efficacy of the Superfund cleanup of active mining, EPA needs to be actively involved. For example, how many of these people came from the Greeley neighborhood? We don't know but EPA and MDEQ should pay particular attention to that area. There are obviously environmental justice concerns here. How will those be addressed?
3. How are citizens to make sense out of the conflicting array of health studies that have been released in the past few years? Currently, there are a confusing plethora of health studies all providing partial and contradictory answers to whether or not Butte is a safe place to live and work. These need to be analyzed and synthesized so that some kind of answer can be given as to whether or not Butte is safe when it comes to environmental toxics, whether from historic mining or active mining.
4. What can be done to address zinc, manganese and copper? They pose a threat to human health, Superfund is supposed to ameliorate such treats, so what will EPA and MDEQ do? Do

we need a ROD amendment for BPSOU? Do we need an aggressive public education campaign?

I realize all of this is very preliminary. There is no need for panic. This was not a full blown study. But it raises alarm bells. **We need to get out in front of this. We need to be proactive.** If we don't respond, the public perception will be that there is a significant issue here. There may be. We need to take the lead on this or the situation will be defined for us and perhaps not in the way we would want. In any event, this is a potentially significant public health issue related to Superfund and needs consideration. We should not just dismiss this information.

Dr. John W. Ray